

**LANDMARKS COMMISSION**  
**August 23, 2018**

**LAN20180823-1**  
**UNAPPROVED**

A regular meeting of the Landmarks Commission, City of Cedarburg, Wisconsin, was held Thursday, August 23, 2018 at Cedarburg City Hall, W63 N645 Washington Avenue, lower level, room 1.

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Judy Jepson at 7:01 p.m.

Roll Call:	Present –	Judy Jepson, Tomi Fay Forbes, Tom Kubala (left meeting at 7:10 p.m.), James Pape, Robert Ross, James Temmer
	Excused –	Council Member Kristin Burkart, Doug Yip (alt.)
	Also Present –	City Planner Jon Censky, Frank Dowd, Dan Davis, Joe Bassindale

**STATEMENT OF PUBLIC NOTICE**

Chairperson Jepson acknowledged that the agenda for this meeting was posted and distributed in compliance with the Wisconsin Open Meetings Law.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Motion made by Tomi Fay Forbes, seconded by James Temmer, to approve the minutes of the July 12, 2018 meeting. Motion carried without a negative vote with Kristin Burkart and Doug Yip excused.

**COMMENTS AND SUGGESTIONS FROM CITIZENS** – None

**NEW BUSINESS**

**Consider Replacing Failing Cedar Shingles with Fifty-Year TruDefinition Duration Asphalt Shingles of Similar Color on the South St. Francis Borgia Church Located at N44 W6055 Hamilton Road; and Action Thereon**

Frank Dowd, the Director of Administrative Services for St. Francis Borgia Church, described the current situation with the roof. There is external and internal damage, including holes in the roof where sunlight can be seen and rain enters the building. The water penetration is causing damage to the plaster and stonework. There are plans to stabilize and renovate the building to preserve it. Future plans include maintenance of the steeple and tuck pointing. The Building Committee, also represented by Dan Davis and Joe Bassindale at this meeting, sees roof replacement as an initial step. Frank Dowd stated the Committee selected an asphalt that they believed most closely resembles the present colorations of the roof. Bob Ross agreed that the color is similar to the gray cedar shingles now in place. Jim Pape believes the cedar shingles were replaced since he was on the Landmarks Commission, and will check back in his records. Jim Pape asked if the present roof can be repaired. The Church Committee feels it has too much

damage to be repaired. There was acknowledgment of the issue of diminished life-span of cedar shingles today versus old ones cut from old growth wood. The Church Committee did consider cedar shingles, but opted for asphalt, due primarily to durability issues.

The difficulty is presented by Wisconsin's new Preservation Law, stating Landmarks Commissions need to allow like materials. This is in conflict with the Secretary of the Interior Standards, the standards by which Landmarks Commissions are mandated to operate, which direct Commissions to maintain originality in historically designated buildings. Landmarks Commissions must follow set guidelines or they could lose their designation status on the National Register of Historic Places. Tom Kubala sees this as an impossible situation for the City. Planner Censky stated that the Commission needs to follow the law, that the Secretary of the Interior guidelines are guidelines, and that he doesn't believe the City's Historic District would lose their status on the Register, if we follow the Wisconsin law rather than the guidelines.

Judy Jepson and Tomi Fay Forbes expressed concern that permitting an asphalt roof to replace a cedar shingle roof will set a precedent for all other buildings in Cedarburg, which presently have cedar shingle roofs.

Bob Ross made a motion to approve the roof, James Temmer seconded the motion.

James Pape stated that he understood that the Commission has to approve it, based on the current law in Wisconsin.

Tomi Fay Forbes proposed the motion be amended in such a way to lessen its impact on future decisions. She wanted it to be clear that, in this case, the building is so tall it is difficult to see clearly from the street just what the roofing material is. She hopes the owners of Cedarburg's two story buildings with cedar shingles, where roof materials will be seen more clearly, will not take this motion as an endorsement that they can replace their cedar shingle roofs with asphalt.

The amended motion is a motion to approve the material as submitted (fifty-year TruDefinition Duration asphalt shingles) only because the new law has been changed, which ties the Commission's hands in terms of the materials used. This does not bind the Commission for future decisions. The material being proposed is difficult to discern from the present cedar shingle roof from the street level when an individual is standing directly beside the building, due to the height of the building. The motion passed unanimously with Tom Kubala, Council Member Burkart and Doug Yip excused. Frank Dowd thanked the Commission Members for their hard work and thorough consideration of their charge to maintain Cedarburg's historic integrity.

**Consider Certificate of Appropriateness to Replace the Front Door of the Stagecoach Inn Located at W61 N520 Washington Avenue; and Action Thereon**

The present door is not original to the building. Jim Pape asked if there are any photos of the building with the original door. Jim Pape proposed the Commission table the proposal until we attempt to locate photographic evidence of the original door. Bob Ross seconded the motion. The motion carried with Tom Kubala, Council Member Burkart and Doug Yip excused.

**ADJOURNMENT**

Motion made by Jim Pape, seconded by Bob Ross, to adjourn the meeting at 7:35 p.m. Motion carried without a negative vote with Tom Kubala, Council Member Burkart and Doug Yip excused.

Tomi Fay Forbes  
Secretary

adk