

LANDMARKS COMMISSION
September 22, 2016

LAN20160922-1
UNAPPROVED

A regular meeting of the Landmarks Commission, City of Cedarburg, Wisconsin, was held Thursday, September 22, 2016 at Cedarburg City Hall, W63 N645 Washington Avenue, lower level, room 2.

The meeting was called to order by Chairperson Judy Jepson at 7:00 p.m.

Roll Call: Present - Council Member Patricia Thome, Judy Jepson, Tomi Fay Forbes, Tom Kubala, Robert Ross

Excused - Doug Yip, James Pape

Also Present - Council Member Jack Arnett, City Planner Jon Censky

STATEMENT OF PUBLIC NOTICE

Chairperson Jepson acknowledged that the agenda for this meeting was posted and distributed in compliance with the Wisconsin Open Meetings Law.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

It was noted that under the "Adjournment" on the minutes for September 8, it should state that the "Motion was carried without a negative vote with Tomi Fay Forbes, Doug Yip and Tom Kubala excused."

Motion made by Council Member Thome, seconded by Bob Ross, to approve the minutes of the September 8, 2016 meeting as corrected. Motion carried without a negative vote with Doug Yip and James Pape excused.

COMMENTS AND SUGGESTIONS FROM CITIZENS – None

REGULAR BUSINESS

Review and Approve Sign for New Fortune Restaurant to be Opening at W62 N547 Washington Avenue; and Action Thereon.

Jimmy and Bridgida Phoa of W62 N369 Hanover Avenue are re-opening the New Fortune Restaurant Jimmy's parents ran some years ago. The new sign will be placed in the existing frame.

Motion made by Tom Kubala, seconded by Council Member Thome, to approve the sign as proposed. Motion carried without a negative vote with Doug Yip and James Pape excused.

Certificate of Appropriateness to Construct a Columbarium at Advent Lutheran Church at W63 N642 Washington Avenue: and Action Thereon

The columbarium is going to the Plan Commission on October 3. The design, appearance, and use of materials should be consistent with materials now on the church. The landscape and lighting need to be appropriate for the area. Legally the project can proceed. 144 niches will be constructed in the first phase. Doreen Lettau, N78 W8060 TopView Trail, represented Advent Church. She displayed the material to be used, including a stone similar to that used on the church and granite for the façade of the niches. Bob Ross stated he appreciates the landscape design.

Motion made by Tom Kubala, seconded by Council Member Thome, to approve the landscape design as proposed. Motion carried without a negative vote with Doug Yip and James Pape excused.

Consider Removal of the Parish Rectory at N44 W6035 Hamilton Road from the Washington Avenue Historic District and to Raze the Structure; and Action Thereon.

The Plan Commission recommended rezoning of this site subject to the Landmarks Commission approving the razing of the rectory structure. The recommendation of the Landmarks Commission will go on to the Plan Commission's October 3 meeting. After that meeting, a public hearing will be scheduled.

Bob Ross asked about the rezoning of the St. Francis Borgia (SFB) property. Planner Censky stated that the present plan does not include the presence of the rectory. Tom Kubala stated that the job of the Landmarks Commission is to protect the historic district. Both the contributing and non-contributing buildings are critical to the district. The rectory is listed as a contributing building. Demolition is not necessary to develop the SFB property. It is financially viable to move ahead with a smart growth project without razing the rectory.

Tony DeRosa and Eric Harrmann (of Brookfield and Wauwatosa, respectively) represented the developer, HSI Properties. Tony DeRosa stated that the project is still in the design phase, and showed drawings of both the site plan and proposed buildings. He stated that 40 parking spaces are designated for the church. There was some discussion regarding traffic flow.

Eric Harrmann stated that the rectory would block access to Hamilton Road and would force more traffic onto Washington Avenue. There was also discussion regarding the expense of the underground parking and that it will be under each building. Most apartment units will have two bedrooms, probably of interest to an older demographic, and tenants will probably have two cars.

Tony DeRosa stated that if the rectory is not removed, the project, potentially valued at \$12 to \$15 million, would not make financial sense. Tom Kubala asked why not consider keeping the rectory as a starting point in the design? He does not consider this project to be an 'either or' situation.

Council Member Thome reminded those present that the project is still evolving.

Tony DeRosa asked for the definition of a contributing structure. Tom Kubala stated there are three reasons a building can be defined as contributing:

- 1) Architectural significance
- 2) An historic event occurred at this location
- 3) The building is part of a complex of buildings

The historic district was drawn by consultants; the City accepted the recommendation of those consultants. Tom Kubala agreed the building is not necessarily of outstanding architectural style, but it is a 1920 bungalow with fairly good proportions and it is clearly associated with the church complex.

Council Member Thome stated that people are calling her who are done with caring for a house and want a high end quality place to live while remaining in Cedarburg. This complex would satisfy that need. The first step is to make this project the best project the City can do, and HSI Properties are people who can do that.

Judy Jepson expressed concern that the proposal will dominate over the church with buildings, affecting the visual scale of the church. She stated that no one has ever asked the Landmarks Commission to move the border of a historic district. If it is done for one project, will others ask the same?

Tomi Fay Forbes stated she can see the SFB School from her house. She is concerned about the scale of the project, and is opposed to razing the rectory.

Community members were present and expressed their concerns:

Bill Bujanovich, W61 N459 Washington Avenue: The City has worked hard to retain the historic district, which has contributed to Cedarburg's economic success over the years. Chopping away at the historic district is paramount to chopping away at the source of the City's success. The proposed project is not sensitive to the historic district; the scale is out of proportion.

Eric Hofhine, N64 W5782 Columbia Road: A 45-year resident of the City who owns the old stone home that contributed to Bridge Commons, a development of homes he considers aesthetically positive for the community. Mr. Hofhine would like to see a complex that contributes to the City, with buildings scaled to the City. He stated that the rectory is a notable building in the town, part of the church complex, and he does not want to see it removed. Over the years, some buildings have been systematically razed, buildings which were significant to the community.

Planner Censky pointed out that the Landmarks Commission is addressing that challenge by working to identify homes that should be protected through historic designation.

Gus Wirth, N48 W6100 Spring Street: Understands the need for so many units per acre to make the project viable. He stated when he developed Woodmere Apartments, he worked around old trees rather than taking them down. He recalls the proposal to knock down the St. Francis

Borgia Church and stated the same type of thinking applies to this proposal. The rectory contributes to the site.

Bud Palmer, W59 N451 Hilgen Avenue: Moved to Cedarburg four years ago and lives in the oldest house on Hilgen Avenue, his house would back up to the drainage pond on the proposed site. The historic fabric of Cedarburg is what distinguishes it from other communities. He loves the view of the sunset behind the church steeple. The proposed buildings would block that. He is a semi-retired minister. When he visits former churches where he served, he enjoys visiting the entire complex – church, parsonage and cemetery. The rectory is part of that complex for St. Francis Borgia.

Dan Carr (W59 N397 Hilbert): Has been in his home for 19 years and he commented on the local traffic becoming more intense and challenges of parking during festivals. He stated that the City could end up with some huge buildings that don't mix well with the existing older buildings. The rectory is like a bookend to the church and part of the historical fabric of the City.

Bob Ross made a motion to recommend denial of the request to remove the rectory. Tom Kubala seconded the motion. Motion carried with Judy Jepson, Tomi Fay Forbes, Tom Kubala and Bob Ross in favor, Council Member Thome opposed, and Doug Yip and James Pape excused.

ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Tom Kubala, seconded by Bob Ross, to adjourn the meeting at 7:55 p.m. Motion carried without a negative vote with Doug Yip and James Pape excused.

Tomi Fay Forbes
Secretary

adk